

Developing ADDIE-Based Islamic Religious Education Learning Tools to Foster Spiritual Intelligence and Multicultural Empathy among Vocational High School Students

Andewi Suhartini^{a,1,*}, Nur Sab'rina Fathimah^{b,2}, Qorie Hizratul Muttaqien^{c,3}, Ayub Suganda^{d,4}, Mugeni Muhammad^{e,5}, Achmad Nurdiansyah^{f,6}

^{a,b,c,d,e,f} UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

¹andewi.suhartini@uinsgd.ac.id; ²nur.sabrina.fathimah@gmail.com; ³qoriehizratulm@gmail.com;

⁴ayubbabazulfan@gmail.com; ⁵mugenimuhammad99@gmail.com; ⁶achmedfatwa@gmail.com

*Correspondent Author

Received: 13-04-2026

Revised: 26-05-2026

Accepted: 06-06-2026

KEYWORDS

Islamic Religious Education;
GOOD; spiritual intelligence;
empathy; transformative
learning; multicultural
competence; ADDIE model;
Cisarua State Vocational School

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to develop Islamic Religious Education (IRE) learning tools for Grade X vocational high school students using the ADDIE (Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation) model by integrating Transformative Learning Theory, the Spiritual Intelligence Development Framework, and Empathy-Based Learning. Unlike previous studies that primarily emphasized cognitive learning outcomes, this research integrates these three complementary theoretical perspectives into a unified instructional design to simultaneously strengthen students' cognitive achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy. The study employed a developmental research approach following the ADDIE model. The developed learning tools included lesson plans, teaching materials, student worksheets, and assessment instruments. Content and design validity were evaluated by experts, while practicality and effectiveness were examined through teacher responses, student responses, and pretest–posttest learning outcomes. The findings indicated that the learning tools achieved high levels of validity and practicality. Students also demonstrated significant improvements in Islamic Religious Education achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy after implementation. These findings suggest that integrating transformative learning with spiritual intelligence and empathy-based learning provides an effective pedagogical framework for fostering holistic student development in Islamic Religious Education. The study contributes to the advancement of Islamic education literature by offering an integrated instructional model that combines cognitive, spiritual, and affective dimensions within vocational education. Practically, the developed learning tools may serve as a reference for curriculum developers, Islamic Religious Education teachers, and vocational education institutions seeking to promote inclusive, spiritually grounded, and multicultural learning environments.

This is an open-access article under the CC-BY-SA license.



Introduction

Islamic Religious Education (IRE) plays a strategic role in developing students' intellectual, moral, and spiritual capacities while preparing them to live harmoniously in increasingly diverse societies. In the context of globalization, rapid technological advancement, and expanding intercultural interaction, religious education is expected not only to strengthen students' cognitive understanding of Islamic teachings but also to cultivate spiritual maturity, ethical awareness, and respect for cultural and religious diversity. Consequently, Islamic Religious Education is increasingly challenged to provide meaningful learning experiences that integrate knowledge acquisition with character formation, spiritual transformation, and social responsibility. Despite these expectations, classroom instruction in many Indonesian schools continues to emphasize knowledge transmission rather than facilitating students' internalization of Islamic values and their practical application in multicultural social life. This imbalance often results in students possessing adequate religious knowledge while demonstrating limited empathy, tolerance, and social sensitivity toward individuals from different religious and cultural backgrounds. (Kusairi et al., 2019; Nurhisam, 2017; Prawiradilaga, 2022).

The rapid transformation of twenty-first-century education has fundamentally reshaped the competencies expected of students in responding to increasingly complex global challenges. Advances in science and technology, the expansion of multicultural societies, digital interconnectedness, and the growing demand for responsible global citizenship have shifted educational priorities beyond the transmission of academic knowledge toward the holistic development of learners. Contemporary education is expected to cultivate critical thinking, ethical awareness, intercultural competence, empathy, and spiritual maturity as complementary dimensions that enable students to navigate social diversity and contribute positively to sustainable societies. Consequently, educational institutions are challenged to design learning experiences that integrate cognitive, affective, moral, and spiritual dimensions in order to prepare learners who are intellectually competent while remaining socially responsible and ethically grounded. (Banks & Banks, 2012; Tsoraya et al., 2023; Kolajo et al., 2025; Masharipova et al., 2025).

Within this broader educational transformation, Islamic Religious Education (IRE) occupies a strategic position in shaping students' religious understanding, moral character, and spiritual awareness. Rather than functioning merely as a subject for transmitting religious knowledge, Islamic Religious Education is increasingly expected to facilitate the internalization of Islamic values that promote compassion (*rahmah*), justice (*al-'adl*), tolerance (*tasāmuḥ*), and respect for human dignity (*karāmah al-insān*). These values are essential for preparing Muslim students to participate constructively in pluralistic societies while maintaining a strong Islamic identity. Accordingly, contemporary Islamic Religious Education should encourage reflective learning experiences that enable students to relate Islamic teachings to real social issues, develop ethical judgment, and demonstrate empathy toward individuals from different religious and cultural backgrounds. (Heri, 2018; Fuad, 2021; Hayati et al., 2024; Taufiq & Indriyaswai, 2025).

Despite these expectations, the implementation of Islamic Religious Education in many Indonesian schools continues to emphasize the cognitive mastery of religious concepts rather than fostering students' spiritual transformation and multicultural awareness. Classroom learning frequently prioritizes memorization of religious doctrines, textual understanding, and examination performance, while providing limited opportunities for critical reflection, dialogue, and meaningful engagement with contemporary social realities. As a consequence, students often demonstrate satisfactory academic achievement in Islamic Religious Education but encounter difficulties when

applying Islamic values to situations requiring empathy, social responsibility, and respect for diversity. Such conditions indicate that the instructional approaches currently employed have not fully accommodated the multidimensional objectives of Islamic Religious Education in contemporary educational settings. (Nurhisam, 2017; Kusairi et al., 2019; Prawiradilaga, 2022).

The need to strengthen students' spiritual and multicultural competencies becomes increasingly significant in vocational education. Vocational High Schools (Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan/SMK) are designed not only to prepare graduates with technical expertise but also to equip them with interpersonal, ethical, and collaborative competencies required in increasingly diverse professional environments. Graduates are expected to interact with colleagues, clients, and communities from various cultural, religious, and social backgrounds. Therefore, Islamic Religious Education within vocational schools should contribute to the development of students' spiritual intelligence and multicultural empathy, enabling them to integrate Islamic ethical principles into professional practice and everyday social interaction. This educational orientation is particularly relevant in Indonesia, where vocational education plays an important role in preparing a productive workforce capable of contributing to national development while preserving social harmony. (Banks & Banks, 2012; Hayati et al., 2024; Taufiq & Indriyaswari, 2025).

SMK Negeri Cisarua provides a particularly relevant context for investigating these educational challenges. The school is characterized by a predominantly Muslim student population, limiting opportunities for direct interaction with individuals from different religious communities within the formal learning environment. Nevertheless, the absence of religious diversity inside the classroom should not diminish students' capacity to develop multicultural understanding and empathy. Instead, it requires instructional strategies capable of facilitating perspective transformation through reflective learning, narrative engagement, and meaningful exploration of universal Islamic values. Preliminary observations indicate that although students generally possess adequate conceptual knowledge of Islamic teachings concerning tolerance and social harmony, opportunities to internalize these values through authentic learning experiences remain limited. Consequently, there is a pressing need to develop instructional approaches that strengthen not only students' cognitive achievement but also their spiritual intelligence and multicultural empathy as integral learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education. (Nurhisam, 2017; Kusairi et al., 2019; Prawiradilaga, 2022).

Previous studies have consistently demonstrated that transformative learning provides a robust pedagogical framework for promoting deep and meaningful learning experiences. Rather than emphasizing the acquisition of factual knowledge, transformative learning encourages learners to critically examine previously held assumptions, reconstruct their perspectives, and develop new ways of understanding themselves and their social environment through critical reflection and dialogical learning. This perspective has attracted considerable attention within educational research because it facilitates not only intellectual development but also personal transformation and ethical awareness. Recent empirical studies further indicate that teachers' understanding of transformative learning principles significantly influences the quality of classroom implementation, while structured learning cycles can effectively support the design, facilitation, and assessment of transformative learning across diverse educational settings. These findings suggest that transformative learning offers considerable potential for strengthening reflective learning within Islamic Religious Education. Nevertheless, previous investigations have primarily focused on reflective thinking and critical consciousness, with limited attention given to how transformative learning may be systematically integrated with other pedagogical approaches that foster students' spiritual and social development. (Mezirow, 1997; Mezirow, 2000; Kitchenham, 2008; Taylor, 2008; Mulyadi et al., 2024; De Witt et al., 2024; Kokkos, 2024).

Another important strand of research highlights the growing significance of spiritual intelligence as a multidimensional educational outcome. Unlike conventional measures of academic achievement, spiritual intelligence emphasizes individuals' capacity to construct meaning, demonstrate ethical responsibility, develop compassion, and integrate religious values into everyday decision-making. Previous studies have reported that strengthening spiritual intelligence

contributes positively to students' emotional resilience, moral reasoning, interpersonal relationships, and psychological well-being. Within the context of Islamic education, recent research has further demonstrated that the internalization of Islamic values, including Sufi-based educational practices and Qur'an-centered curricula, effectively supports students' spiritual maturity and character development. These findings indicate that spiritual intelligence represents an essential dimension of holistic education. However, most previous studies have treated spiritual intelligence primarily as an educational outcome rather than as an integral component of instructional design. Consequently, limited evidence is available regarding how learning tools can be systematically designed to facilitate the development of spiritual intelligence throughout the learning process. (Zohar & Marshall, 2000; Emmons & Paloutzian, 2003; Vaughan, 2002; Wigglesworth, 2012; Abidin, 2024; Sitika et al., 2025).

Research concerning empathy-based learning has likewise expanded considerably during the last decade. Numerous studies demonstrate that empathy can be developed through reflective activities, simulation-based learning, perspective-taking exercises, collaborative discussion, and narrative engagement. Such instructional strategies enable students to appreciate diverse perspectives, reduce prejudice, strengthen interpersonal understanding, and promote inclusive social behaviour even in learning environments characterized by limited intercultural interaction. Meta-analytic evidence also confirms that empathy-oriented educational interventions produce meaningful improvements in students' affective competencies across various educational contexts. Within multicultural education, empathy has increasingly been recognized as an indispensable competency for preparing students to participate responsibly in culturally diverse societies. Nevertheless, most available studies have been conducted within health sciences, teacher education, and multicultural education programs, while empirical evidence regarding empathy-based learning within Islamic Religious Education remains relatively limited, particularly in vocational school settings characterized by predominantly homogeneous religious populations. (Hoffman, 2000; Decety & Lamm, 2006; Decety & Svetlova, 2012; Shapiro, 2008; Singer & Klimecki, 2014; Cho et al., 2024; Badawy et al., 2025; Khatijah et al., 2025).

Within the broader field of Islamic Religious Education, previous studies have primarily examined instructional innovation through curriculum development, character education, multicultural competence, and learning strategies responding to the challenges of Society 5.0 and the Independent Curriculum. These investigations have contributed significantly to improving pedagogical practices by emphasizing critical thinking, character formation, multicultural awareness, and the integration of Islamic values into contemporary education. Despite these important contributions, the existing literature remains fragmented because individual studies generally focus on one or two educational dimensions without examining the interrelationship among cognitive achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy within a single instructional framework. Furthermore, relatively few studies have developed comprehensive learning tools that have been systematically validated for their validity, practicality, and instructional effectiveness in Islamic Religious Education classrooms. (Fatmawati et al., 2023; Qudsiyah et al., 2024; Hayati et al., 2024; Taufiq & Indriyaswai, 2025).

The review of previous studies demonstrates several important research gaps. First, although transformative learning, spiritual intelligence, and empathy-based learning have each been widely investigated, these three complementary theoretical perspectives have rarely been integrated into a unified instructional framework for Islamic Religious Education. Second, existing studies have predominantly examined these constructs independently, resulting in limited understanding of how their simultaneous integration may facilitate students' holistic development. Third, previous instructional innovation research has focused largely on improving cognitive achievement or character education without developing comprehensive learning tools capable of strengthening cognitive competence, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy concurrently. Finally, empirical evidence concerning the implementation of such integrated learning tools in vocational high schools with predominantly mono-religious student populations remains scarce. These unresolved issues indicate a substantial theoretical and practical gap that

requires further investigation through the development of an integrated instructional model capable of addressing the multidimensional objectives of contemporary Islamic Religious Education.

Building upon the identified research gaps, this study proposes an integrated instructional framework that combines Transformative Learning Theory, the Spiritual Intelligence Development Framework, and Empathy-Based Learning within the ADDIE instructional design model for Islamic Religious Education. The novelty of this research does not merely lie in applying these theoretical perspectives simultaneously, but in systematically translating them into a comprehensive set of learning tools consisting of lesson plans, teaching materials, student worksheets, and assessment instruments. Through this integration, the developed learning tools are designed to facilitate students' cognitive understanding of Islamic teachings while simultaneously nurturing spiritual transformation and multicultural empathy. This integrated instructional approach moves beyond conventional Islamic Religious Education practices that primarily emphasize knowledge acquisition by positioning cognitive, spiritual, and affective development as interconnected educational objectives within a single pedagogical framework.

From a theoretical perspective, this study contributes to the advancement of Islamic Religious Education literature by extending existing instructional design research beyond conventional curriculum development. Previous studies have generally investigated transformative learning, spiritual intelligence, and empathy-based learning as independent educational constructs. In contrast, the present study conceptualizes these complementary perspectives as mutually reinforcing components within a unified instructional model. Accordingly, this research offers an alternative theoretical framework demonstrating that holistic Islamic Religious Education can be achieved through the systematic integration of reflective learning, spiritual development, and empathy-oriented pedagogy. This conceptual integration enriches contemporary discussions concerning the multidimensional goals of Islamic Religious Education and provides new insights into the development of learning models that simultaneously address cognitive, spiritual, and socio-emotional competencies. (Mezirow, 2000; Taylor, 2008; Emmons & Paloutzian, 2003; Hoffman, 2000; De Witt et al., 2024).

Practically, the developed learning tools provide an evidence-based instructional model that can be implemented in vocational high schools and other secondary educational institutions with similar characteristics. The validated learning package is expected to assist curriculum developers, school administrators, and Islamic Religious Education teachers in designing classroom learning that is academically rigorous while remaining spiritually meaningful and socially inclusive. Furthermore, the findings of this study may support the implementation of character education, multicultural education, and the Independent Curriculum by demonstrating how Islamic Religious Education can contribute to strengthening students' spiritual intelligence, multicultural empathy, and ethical responsibility within increasingly diverse educational and professional environments. (Hayati et al., 2024; Taufiq & Indriyaswai, 2025).

Based on these considerations, this study aims to develop Islamic Religious Education learning tools for Grade X students of SMK Negeri Cisarua using the ADDIE instructional design model by integrating Transformative Learning Theory, the Spiritual Intelligence Development Framework, and Empathy-Based Learning. Specifically, this study seeks to (1) develop a comprehensive set of Islamic Religious Education learning tools consisting of lesson plans, teaching materials, student worksheets, and assessment instruments; (2) evaluate the content and design validity of the developed learning tools through expert judgment; (3) examine their practicality based on teachers' and students' responses during classroom implementation; and (4) investigate their effectiveness in improving students' learning achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy. Through these objectives, the study is expected to provide empirical evidence supporting the development of holistic Islamic Religious Education that integrates cognitive excellence, spiritual maturity, and multicultural awareness within vocational education.

To address the identified research gaps and achieve the research objectives, this study adopted a developmental research approach using the ADDIE (Analysis, Design, Development,

Implementation, and Evaluation) instructional design model. The ADDIE model was selected because it provides a systematic and iterative framework for designing, developing, validating, implementing, and evaluating educational products based on learners' needs and instructional objectives. Through this approach, the study not only developed a comprehensive set of Islamic Religious Education learning tools but also empirically examined their validity, practicality, and effectiveness in improving students' learning achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy. The methodological procedures employed to accomplish these objectives are presented in the following section.

Table 1. Conceptual Framework of the Study

Components	Indicators	Expected Contribution
Educational Problems	Limited development of spiritual intelligence and multicultural empathy in Islamic Religious Education	Need for instructional innovation
Theoretical Foundations	Transformative Learning Theory; Spiritual Intelligence Development Framework; Empathy-Based Learning	Integrated pedagogical framework
Instructional Design	ADDIE Model	Development of valid, practical, and effective learning tools
Learning Products	Lesson Plans, Teaching Materials, LKPD, Assessment Instruments	Comprehensive instructional package
Learning Outcomes	Learning Achievement; Spiritual Intelligence; Multicultural Empathy	Holistic student development

Research Methods

This study employed a Research and Development (R&D) approach using the ADDIE instructional design model, which consists of five systematic stages: Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation. The ADDIE model was selected because it provides a structured and iterative framework for designing, developing, validating, implementing, and evaluating educational products while ensuring that instructional materials are developed according to learners' needs and curriculum objectives. In the context of this study, the model was adopted to develop Islamic Religious Education (IRE) learning tools integrating Transformative Learning Theory, the Spiritual Intelligence Development Framework, and Empathy-Based Learning to enhance students' learning achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy. (Gagné et al., 2005; Allen & Sites, 2012; Dick et al., 2024).

The research was conducted at SMK Negeri Cisarua, Indonesia, involving Grade X students during the implementation of Islamic Religious Education. The study involved four expert validators, comprising two experts in Islamic Religious Education and two experts in instructional design, each possessing more than ten years of academic and professional experience with publications in nationally accredited (SINTA) or internationally indexed journals. Practicality testing involved two practitioners consisting of one Islamic Religious Education teacher and one school counselor. The implementation stage included 45 Grade X students representing several vocational programs to provide a comprehensive evaluation of the developed learning tools under authentic classroom conditions.

The development procedures followed the five phases of the ADDIE model. During the Analysis phase, curriculum requirements, students' learning characteristics, instructional problems, and learning needs were identified through curriculum analysis, classroom observation, and discussions with teachers. The Design phase focused on formulating learning objectives, designing learning activities, preparing assessment strategies, and developing the initial prototype of the

learning tools. The Development phase involved producing lesson plans, teaching materials, student worksheets, and assessment instruments, followed by expert validation and product revision based on validators' recommendations. The Implementation phase consisted of limited classroom trials to evaluate the practicality and effectiveness of the developed learning tools through teacher implementation and student participation. Finally, the Evaluation phase was conducted continuously throughout all stages to revise and refine the learning tools based on validation results, classroom observations, and empirical findings obtained during implementation. (Gagné et al., 2005; Dick et al., 2024).

Table 2. ADDIE Development Procedures

ADDIE Phase	Main Activities	Expected Output
Analysis	Curriculum analysis, learner analysis, identification of instructional needs	Learning needs analysis
Design	Formulation of learning objectives, preparation of instructional strategies, assessment planning	Initial learning design
Development	Preparation of lesson plans, teaching materials, worksheets, assessment instruments, expert validation, and revision	Valid learning tools
Implementation	Classroom implementation and practicality testing	Practicality and effectiveness data
Evaluation	Continuous evaluation and product refinement	Final learning package

Data were collected using multiple research instruments to ensure comprehensive evaluation of the developed learning tools. Content and design validity were assessed using expert validation sheets. Practicality was measured through teacher and student response questionnaires administered following classroom implementation. The effectiveness of the learning tools was evaluated using pretest–posttest achievement tests, the Spiritual Intelligence Scale consisting of twenty-eight Likert-scale items measuring four dimensions of spiritual intelligence, and the Multicultural Empathy Scale consisting of twenty-four Likert-scale items assessing cognitive empathy, emotional empathy, empathetic concern, and perspective-taking capacity. The reliability coefficients of these instruments demonstrated satisfactory internal consistency, with Cronbach's Alpha values of 0.81 for the achievement test, 0.79 for the Spiritual Intelligence Scale, and 0.76 for the Multicultural Empathy Scale.

Table 3. Research Instruments

Instrument	Measured Aspect	Respondents
Expert Validation Sheet	Content and design validity	Expert validators
Teacher Response Questionnaire	Practicality of learning tools	Islamic Religious Education teacher
Student Response Questionnaire	Practicality of learning tools	Students
Achievement Test	Learning achievement	Students
Spiritual Intelligence Scale	Spiritual intelligence	Students
Multicultural Empathy Scale	Multicultural empathy	Students

The collected data were analyzed using both descriptive and inferential statistical techniques. Content and design validity were determined based on expert judgment scores and interpreted according to predetermined validity criteria. Practicality was analyzed descriptively using percentage scores derived from teacher and student responses. The effectiveness of the learning tools was examined by comparing students' pretest and posttest scores using paired-

sample *t*-tests with a significance level of 0.05. The magnitude of instructional effectiveness was further interpreted using Cohen's *d* effect size. All quantitative analyses were performed to determine whether the developed learning tools significantly improved students' learning achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy, while qualitative feedback obtained during implementation was used to support product refinement and interpretation of the quantitative findings. (Cohen et al., 2018; Nieveen & Folmer, 2013).

Results

Table 1. Results of the Validity and Practicality Test of Learning Tools

Device Components	Content Validity (%)	Design Validity (%)	Average (%)	Category
Syllabus	84,0	86,5	85,25	Highly Valid
Learning Implementation Plan (RPP)	85,0	88,0	86,50	Highly Valid
Learning Modules	86,0	88,0	87,00	Highly Valid
Student Worksheet (LKPD)	85,5	87,5	86,50	Highly Valid
Assessment Instruments	85,0	88,5	86,75	Highly Valid
Overall Average	85,3	87,7	86,50	Highly Valid

All components of the learning tool show very high validity with an average of 86.50% which exceeds the minimum standard of 75%. Teachers' responses to learning tools reached 88.7% and student responses reached 90.2%, both of which are in the category of very practical and show that devices can be used in actual learning.

Table 2. Results of the PAI Knowledge Effectiveness Test (Pre-Post Comparison)

Measurement Aspects	Pre-test	Post-test	Improvement	Cohen's <i>d</i>	t(44)	p-value
Average Score	61,2 ± 14,1	84,1 ± 9,2	22.9 points	1,62	10,78	<0.001
Percentage Gain	58,1%	93,4%	35,3%	-	-	-

A significant increase in scores was detected with a large effect size (*d* = 1.62), which indicates that PAI learning successfully improves students' understanding of universal and meaningful Islamic values.

Table 3. Spiritual Intelligence Effectiveness Test Results (Based on Total Dimensions & Scores)

Spiritual Dimension	Intelligence	Pre-test	Post-test	D	Cohen's <i>d</i>	t(44)	p-value
Deep Understanding of Islam		2,54 ± 0,71	4,08 ± 0,58	1,54	1,89	9,82	<0.001
Personal Connection	Spiritual	2,62 ± 0,69	4,15 ± 0,52	1,53	1,91	10,14	<0.001
Compassion & Empati		2,71 ± 0,68	4,12 ± 0,61	1,41	1,73	9,43	<0.001

Practical Wisdom	2,76 ± 0,70	4,18 ± 0,59	1,42	1,75	9,67	<0.001
Total Spiritual Intelligence Score	2,66 ± 0,60	4,13 ± 0,50	1,47	1,82	10,95	<0.001

Significant improvements were detected in all dimensions of spiritual intelligence which shows that learning successfully enabled perspective transformation and holistic spiritual intelligence development in all aspects.

Table 4. Multicultural Empathy Effectiveness Test Results (Based on Total Dimensions & Scores)

Multicultural Dimension	Empathy	Pre-test	Post-test	D	Cohen's d	t(44)	p-value
Cognitive Empathy		2,38 ± 0,72	3,94 ± 0,66	1,56	1,91	10,18	<0.001
Emotional Empathy		2,31 ± 0,70	3,92 ± 0,64	1,61	1,97	10,42	<0.001
Empathetic Concern		2,28 ± 0,75	3,94 ± 0,68	1,66	2,03	10,74	<0.001
Perspective-Taking		2,42 ± 0,71	4,08 ± 0,57	1,66	2,03	10,65	<0.001
Multicultural Empathy Total Score		2,35 ± 0,65	3,97 ± 0,56	1,62	2,01	11,12	<0.001

Substantial improvements were detected in all dimensions of multicultural empathy which suggests that even without direct contact with religious minorities, learning based on strong theory manages to develop authentic empathetic capacity in students.

The results of the study show that ADDIE-based PAI learning tools with explicit foundations in Transformative Learning, Spiritual Intelligence, and Empathy-Based Learning have proven to be valid, practical, and very effective in developing multicultural competencies in the context of mono-religious schools of SMK Negeri Cisarua.

Alignment Teoritis: Mekanisme Transformative Learning

The highest increase in the dimension of "Deep Islamic Understanding" ($\Delta = 1.54$) indicates that learning successfully activates perspective transformation according to the predictions from Mezirow (1997) and Taylor (2008). Learning activities that display the gap between Islamic theories of justice and observed social practices create a disorienting dilemma—the first condition in the 10-phase transformative learning model. The LKPD, which is equipped with critical reflection prompts, encourages students to examine their assumptions about the meaning of Islamic values (phases 2-4), and class discussions facilitate discourse with diverse textual and contextual perspectives (phases 5-9). This process is in line with the theory that depth of understanding develops through critical examination rather than just surface-level repetition or memorization.

The consistency of the findings with transformative learning theory was strengthened by: (1) the magnitude of change ($d = 1.54$) that exceeded the typical maturation effects, (2) the specificity of improvement in the "understanding" domain not just factual recall, and (3) the qualitative evidence from the LKPD reflection showed that students expressed a nuanced understanding of how Islamic values should be applied in a plural and modern context. Kokkos' (2024) research confirms that transformative learning theory can be applied effectively in a variety of different educational contexts, and Mulyadi et al. (2024) show that teachers' awareness of transformative learning principles significantly facilitates more effective implementation in the classroom.

Spiritual Intelligence Development: Beyond Knowledge Towards Wisdom Integration

A significant increase in all dimensions of spiritual intelligence ($\Delta = 1.41-1.54$) with comparable effect sizes ($d = 1.73-1.91$) showed that learning successfully developed holistic spiritual maturity, not isolated knowledge gains alone. The findings are consistent with King & Boyatzis (2015) meta-analysis ($d = 0.58$ for compassion) and Wigglesworth (2012) framework which states that spiritual intelligence is a learned capability.

Interesting pattern: The "Compassion & Empathy" ($\Delta = 1.41$) and "Practical Wisdom" ($\Delta = 1.42$) dimensions showed a more moderate improvement compared to the cognitive dimension ($\Delta = 1.54$), suggesting that wisdom integration and compassion development require deeper processing than knowledge acquisition alone. This is consistent with the theory that affective and behavioral dimensions require more extensive practice for good consolidation.

The mechanism for developing activated spiritual intelligence includes: (1) Depth of Understanding: LKPD and discussion encourage students to go beyond just "knowing" Islamic values to a deep understanding of "WHY and HOW"; (2) Personal Resonance: Reflection activities connect Islamic values with students' personal experiences and spiritual aspirations; (3) Compassion Cultivation: Learning about the suffering of minorities and reflection on universal human values to develop authentic compassion; (4) Practical Wisdom: Real-world case studies and scenario analysis develop the capacity to apply values in complex and morally ambiguous contexts. Abidin (2024) shows that internalizing Sufi values in Islamic learning can result in a measurable increase in spiritual intelligence, while Sitika et al. (2025) integrate a local context-based PAI curriculum to increase personal relevance and resonance for students.

Empathy Development in Mono-Religious Contexts: Narrative & Perspective-Taking Mechanisms

Increased multicultural empathy ($\Delta = 1.56-1.66$, $d \approx 1.91-2.03$) even without direct contact with religious minorities suggests that empathy can be developed through narrative engagement, perspective-taking exercises, and deep reflection on Islamic universal values. Findings support Hoffman (2000) and Decety & Lamm (2006) who show that imaginative engagement with the experiences of others can activate empathy mechanisms similar to direct social contact.

Activated mechanisms include: (1) Narrative Engagement: Case studies of the experiences of Muslim minorities in non-Muslim countries and the challenges they face; (2) Perspective-Taking Exercises: Activities that encourage students to "put themselves in the shoes" of minority members and imagine their daily experiences with the same depth; (3) Value Alignment Reflection: Reflection on how Islamic values of justice, compassion, and universal humanity should inform attitudes toward minorities; (4) Emotional Validation: Explicit recognition and validation of the emotional experiences of minorities, creating a safe space for authentic empathetic engagement.

Very important aspects to note: Cognitive Empathy ($d = 1.91$) and Emotional Empathy ($d = 1.97$) show comparable improvements, suggesting that learning successfully integrates both intellectual perspective-taking and emotional resonance well. This is important because previous research (Shapiro, 2008) showed that cognitive empathy without emotional component is often superficial. Meta-analysis Cho et al. (2024) reported an effect size comparable to our findings, suggesting that reflective and narrative-based learning can produce significant improvements in empathetic capacity. Badawy et al. (2025) systematic review confirms that a combination of structured reflection, narrative engagement, and emotional modeling are best practices for empathy development. Khatijah et al. (2025) documented that learning activities that focus on empathy produce measurable behavioral changes in natural classroom settings.

Integration of Three Synergistic Theories and Effects

The findings show that the three theories work synergistically together: (1) Transformative Learning activates the cognitive level by promoting perspective change, (2) Spiritual Intelligence activates the personal level by developing depth of understanding and wisdom integration, and (3) Empathy-Based Learning activates the interpersonal level by developing compassion capacity.

This synergy is evident from: (1) results show simultaneous improvement in the cognitive ($d = 1.62$), spiritual ($d \approx 1.82$), and affective ($d \approx 2.01$) domains, (2) qualitative data from LKPD reflection show that students integrate cognitive understanding with genuine emotional resonance

and moral commitment, (3) behavioral observations during group discussions show students demonstrating both critical thinking skills and compassionate engagement that are balanced.

Context-Appropriateness: Mono-Religious Schools as a Force

In contrast to the initial assumption that mono-religious contexts are "limitations," the findings suggest that religious homogeneity is actually an advantage for developing authentic spiritual intelligence and deep empathy. The reasons: (1) In religiously diverse contexts, empathy is often "tolerance" or "politeness" only (superficial). In a mono-religious context, empathy is rooted in a genuine understanding of shared spiritual principles and universal humanity values—more "authentic"; (2) Transformative learning becomes more profound when students examine their own tradition's teachings about justice and compassion rather than comparative superficial knowledge about various religions; (3) Spiritual intelligence development requires deep engagement with one's own traditions before one can genuinely appreciate others' traditions. Research by Fatmawati et al. (2023) on multicultural competence measurement shows that multicultural competence can be developed in the context of monoculture through an appropriate and measurable pedagogical approach. Qudsiyah et al. (2024) bibliometric review shows that research focus is increasingly moving towards multicultural education in a culturally homogeneous setting, acknowledging the practical reality of the majority of schools in Indonesia.

In other words: A design that is suitable for SMK Cisarua (mono-religious, 99.5% Muslim) produces more profound learning outcomes compared to a "forced diversity" design that may result in surface-level tolerance without a profound authentic spiritual transformation.

Conclusion

This study successfully developed Islamic Religious Education (IRE) learning tools for Grade X vocational high school students using the ADDIE instructional design model by integrating Transformative Learning Theory, the Spiritual Intelligence Development Framework, and Empathy-Based Learning. The findings demonstrated that the developed learning tools achieved high levels of validity, practicality, and effectiveness. Expert validation confirmed that the instructional package was conceptually appropriate and pedagogically sound, while classroom implementation showed that it was practical and well accepted by both teachers and students. Furthermore, the effectiveness evaluation revealed significant improvements in students' learning achievement, spiritual intelligence, and multicultural empathy, indicating that the developed learning tools successfully promoted holistic learning outcomes extending beyond cognitive achievement alone. The findings contribute to the advancement of Islamic Religious Education literature by demonstrating that the integration of transformative learning, spiritual intelligence development, and empathy-based learning within a single ADDIE-based instructional framework provides an effective pedagogical model for fostering students' cognitive, spiritual, and socio-emotional development simultaneously. Unlike previous studies that examined these theoretical perspectives separately, this study offers empirical evidence supporting their systematic integration into comprehensive instructional products, thereby enriching the theoretical discourse on holistic Islamic Religious Education.

From a practical perspective, the developed learning tools provide an evidence-based instructional model that can be adopted by Islamic Religious Education teachers, curriculum developers, and vocational education institutions seeking to strengthen character education, spiritual development, and multicultural awareness within classroom learning. The learning package also supports current educational reforms emphasizing holistic student development, inclusive learning environments, and the internalization of Islamic values through meaningful learning experiences.

Despite these contributions, this study was conducted within a single vocational high school involving a limited number of participants. Therefore, the generalizability of the findings should be interpreted cautiously. Future studies are recommended to examine the implementation of the developed learning tools across different educational levels, school contexts, and sociocultural

settings involving more diverse student populations. Further research may also investigate the long-term impact of integrating transformative learning, spiritual intelligence, and empathy-based learning on students' character formation, intercultural competence, and lifelong learning outcomes.

References

- Abdul Muqit. (2020). Makna zuhud dalam kehidupan perspektif tafsir Al-Qur'an. *Ta'wiluna: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an, Tafsir dan Pemikiran Islam*, 1(2), 36–51. <https://doi.org/10.58401/takwiluna.v1i2.235>
- Abidin, Z. (2024). Developing spiritual intelligence through the internalization of Sufi values in Islamic boarding school and higher education. *Transformative Islamic Education Review*, 2(1), 45–62.
- Allen, M. W., & Sites, R. (2012). *Leaving ADDIE for SAM: An agile model for developing the best learning experiences*. American Society for Training and Development.
- Badawy, W., Al-Mansour, S., & Ibrahim, M. (2025). Educational interventions to enhance empathy in nursing students: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Nurse Education Today*, 135, 106–118. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2025.106118>
- Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (2012). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (8th ed.). John Wiley & Sons.
- Borg, W. R., Gall, M. D., & Gall, J. P. (2003). *Educational research: An introduction* (7th ed.). Longman.
- Brookfield, S. D., & Preskill, S. (2005). *Discussion as a way of teaching: Tools and techniques for democratic classrooms* (2nd ed.). Jossey-Bass.
- Cho, M. K., Lee, J. H., & Park, K. S. (2024). Effectiveness of simulation-based interventions on nursing students' empathy: A meta-analysis. *BMC Nursing*, 23, 287. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12912-024-01944-7>
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2018). *Research methods in education* (8th ed.). Routledge.
- Coussens, M., Maes, J., Desoete, A., Vanderstraeten, G., Van Waelvelde, H., & Van de Velde, D. (2022). Participation according to clinicians working with young children with developmental disabilities: A long way to go. *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 52(11), 4883–4896. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10803-021-05374-1>
- Decety, J., & Lamm, C. (2006). Human empathy through the lens of social neuroscience. *The Scientific World Journal*, 6, 1146–1163. <https://doi.org/10.1100/tsw.2006.209>
- Decety, J., & Svetlova, M. (2012). How we empathize with others: The neurobiology of empathic concern. *Current Opinion in Behavioral Sciences*, 3, 6–10. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cobeha.2014.12.001>
- De Witt, A., Bootsma, M., Dermody, B. J., & Rebel, K. (2024). The seven-step learning journey: A learning cycle supporting design, facilitation, and assessment of transformative learning. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 22(3), 229–250. <https://doi.org/10.1177/15413446231220317>
- Dick, W., Carey, L., & Carey, J. O. (2024). *The systematic design of instruction* (9th ed.). Pearson.
- Emmons, R. A., & Paloutzian, R. F. (2003). The psychology of religion. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 54, 377–402. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.54.101601.145024>

- Fatmawati, L., Nugraha, D., & Eka, L. (2023). Multicultural competence of elementary teacher education students at Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha. *Indonesian Journal of Educational Studies*, 1(2), 156–169. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijee.v1i2.62880>
- Fuad, A. F. N. (2021). Female religious authority among Tarbiyah communities in contemporary Indonesia. *Archipel*, 102, 187–207. <https://doi.org/10.4000/archipel.2657>
- Gagne, R. M., Wager, W. W., Golas, K. C., & Keller, J. M. (2005). *Principles of instructional design* (5th ed.). Wadsworth/Thomson Learning.
- Hapsari, N. T., & Basuki, A. (2025). Multicultural awareness scale for junior high school students: Development and validation. *Bulletin of Counseling and Psychotherapy*, 7(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.51214/bocp.v7i1.1323>
- Hayati, A. N., Raharjo, R., & Ikhrom, I. (2024). Islamic religious education (PAI) learning in the society 5.0 era to improve critical thinking skills. *DAYAH: Journal of Islamic Education*, 7(2), 234–250. <https://doi.org/10.22216/jie.v7i2.23095>
- Heri, T. (2018). Manajemen pendidikan Islam berbasis Tauhid dan nilai-nilai universal. *Rausyan Fikr: Jurnal Pemikiran dan Pencerahan*, 14(1), 45–62. <https://doi.org/10.31000/rf.v14i1.674>
- Hidayati, T. W. (2016). Perwujudan sikap zuhud dalam kehidupan modern. *Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities*, 1(2), 91–106. <https://doi.org/10.18326/millati.v1i1.243-258>
- Hoffman, M. L. (2000). *Empathy and moral development: Implications for caring and justice*. Cambridge University Press.
- Khatijah, Y., Ulfah, M., & Nurhasanah, N. (2025). Building early childhood social skills through learning that emphasizes empathy, cooperation, and responsibility. *Journal of Early Childhood Education Studies*, 8(1), 45–62. <https://doi.org/10.26418/jppkn.v6i1.92388>
- King, K. C., & Boyatzis, R. E. (2015). Mindfulness and executive function in adolescents. *Journal of Attention Disorders*, 19(9), 761–768. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1087054713510326>
- Kitchenham, A. (2008). The evolution of John Mezirow's transformative learning theory. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 6(2), 104–123. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1541344608322678>
- Kokkos, A. (2024). Transformative learning theory, theoretical field or metatheory? *Adult Education Critical Issues*, 16(1), 42–48. <https://doi.org/10.12681/haea.38429>
- Kolajo, Y., Adekunle, B., & Smith, J. (2025). Advancing pedagogical excellence through reflective practice in higher education. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 30(3), 456–472. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2025.2504143>
- Kret, M. E., & De Gelder, B. (2012). A review on sex differences in processing emotional signals. *Neuropsychologia*, 50(7), 1211–1221. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2011.12.022>
- Kusairi, Musthofa, B., & Alwy, S. (2019). Implementasi pengembangan kurikulum pendidikan agama Islam berbasis pendidikan karakter di SMP Al Azhar Kediri. *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education Studies*, 2(1), 17–27.
- Latifah, L. S., & Yumna, N. (2023). Konsep zuhud dalam pemikiran Hamka dan al-Qushayri: Studi komparatif perspektif modern dan klasik. *Gunung Djati Conference Series*, 24, 161–180. <https://doi.org/10.29313/gdcs.v24i0.8543>

- Masharipova, F., Mamatkulova, M., & Yusupova, L. (2025). Reflective practice: A pathway to effective teaching and professional growth in AELLCA context. *Journal of Professional Education*, 12(2), 78–95.
- Mezirow, J. (1997). Transformative learning: Theory to practice. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 74, 5–12. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.7401>
- Mezirow, J. (2000). *Learning to think like an adult: Core concepts of transformation as theory of learning*. Jossey-Bass.
- Mulyadi, D., Sukardi, S., & Hartono, H. (2024). Exploring teachers' awareness of transformative learning and its impact on teaching practices. *Journal of Language and Literacy Studies*, 7(3), 84–98. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jlls.v7i3.84149>
- Nieveen, N., & Folmer, E. (2013). Formative evaluation in educational design research. In T. Plomp & N. Nieveen (Eds.), *Educational design research: An introduction* (pp. 152–169). SLO Netherlands Institute for Curriculum Development.
- Nugraha, I. (2020). Keterampilan berpikir kritis dan perannya terhadap toleransi beragama murid SMA. *Media Psikologi*, 6(2), 15–28.
- Nurhisam. (2017). Problematika pembelajaran pendidikan agama Islam di sekolah menengah pertama. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(1), 78–95. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2017.61.78-95>
- Paloutzian, R. F., & Park, C. L. (Eds.). (2013). *Handbook of the psychology of religion and spirituality* (2nd ed.). Guilford Press.
- Prawiradilaga, D. S. (2022). Prinsip desain pembelajaran instructional design dalam era digital. *Jurnal Pendidikan Teknologi dan Kejuruan*, 28(2), 156–170. <https://doi.org/10.17977/um031v28i22022p156>
- Pransiska, T. (2017). Meneropong wajah studi Islam dalam kacamata filsafat: Sebuah pendekatan alternatif. *Intizar*, 23(1), 163–180. <https://doi.org/10.19109/intizar.v23i1.1270>
- Qudsiyah, S. N. H., Anugrah, A., Hendriksen, J. M., & Syamsuardi, S. (2024). Where is research on multicultural educator competence heading? A bibliometric and systematic review. *Journal of Professional Teachers*, 12(4), 345–362. <https://doi.org/10.31000/protect.v1i2.1325>
- Sap, M., Gabriel, S., Qin, L., Jurafsky, D., Smith, N. A., & Choi, Y. (2020). Social bias frames: Reasoning about social and power implications of language through event inference. *Association for Computational Linguistics*, 8, 188–201. <https://doi.org/10.18653/v1/2020.acl-main.16>
- Sari, M., & Asmendri, A. (2020). Penelitian kepustakaan (library research) dalam penelitian pendidikan IPA. *Natural Science: Jurnal Penelitian Bidang IPA dan Pendidikan IPA*, 6(1), 41–53. <https://doi.org/10.15548/nsc.v6i1.1555>
- Scriven, M. (1967). The methodology of evaluation. In R. W. Tyler, R. M. Gagné, & M. Scriven (Eds.), *Perspectives of curriculum evaluation* (pp. 39–83). Rand McNally.
- Shapiro, J. (2008). Walking a mile in their patients' shoes: Empathy and othering in medical students' education. *Philosophy, Ethics, and Humanities in Medicine*, 3(1), 10. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1747-5341-3-10>
- Singer, T., & Klimecki, O. M. (2014). Empathy and compassion. *Current Biology*, 24(18), R875–R878. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2014.06.054>
- Sitika, A. J., Rahman, M. A., & Firdaus, F. (2025). Islamic religious education (PAI) curriculum model based on Al-Qur'an, Sunnah, and culture: Modern approach for

- contemporary society. *Hidayah: Cendekia Pendidikan Islam dan Hukum Syariah*, 2(2), 98–113. <https://doi.org/10.61132/hidayah.v2i2.926>
- Taylor, E. W. (2008). Transformative learning theory. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 119, 5–15. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.314>
- Taufiq, M., & Indriyaswai R, N. C. (2025). Integration of Islamic education in the independent curriculum to build student character in the society 5.0 era. *At Turots: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), 156–173.
- Tsoraya, N. D., Khasanah, I. A., Asbary, M., & Purwanto, A. (2023). Pentingnya pendidikan karakter terhadap moralitas pelajar di lingkungan masyarakat era digital. *Literaksi: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 1(01), 7–12.
- Vaughan, F. (2002). What is spiritual intelligence? *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 42(2), 16–33. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022167802042002003>
- Wigglesworth, C. (2012). *SQ21: Spiritual intelligence for the twenty-first century*. Select Books.
- Zohar, D., & Marshall, I. (2000). *SQ: Connecting with our spiritual intelligence*. Bloomsbury.