



The Integration of the *Talqin* Method and the *Sabaq–Sabqi–Manzil* System in the *Ta’hil Mu’allimil Qur’an* Program at Ma’had Al-Atsar Yogyakarta.

Hisbullah Muzahid ^{a.1,*}, Sukari ^{b.2}.

^{*ab} Institut Islam Mamba'ul Ulum, Surakarta, Indonesia.

^{*1}afnandihya@gmail.com, ²sukarisolo@gmail.com

*Correspondent Author: Hisbullah Muzahid : email; afnandihya@gmail.com

Received: 03-07-2026

Revised: 11-08-2026

Accepted: 23-09-2026

KEYWORDS

Talqin Method, Sabaq–Sabqi–Manzil, Qur’anic Teacher Training, Memorization Quality.

ABSTRACT

This study employed a qualitative case study approach with supportive quantitative data to examine the integration of the *Talqin* method and the *Sabaq–Sabqi–Manzil* system in the *Ta’hil Mu’allimil Qur’an* Program at *Ma’had Al-Atsar Yogyakarta*. The purpose of this research was to analyze the implementation process of the integrated instructional model and to evaluate its contribution to improving the memorization quality and pedagogical competence of *santri* as prospective Qur’anic teachers. The study aimed to provide an in-depth understanding of how direct transmission-based learning (*talqin*) is systematically combined with structured memorization cycles (*sabaq*, *sabqi*, and *manzil*) within a teacher preparation program. The participants consisted of 30 *santri* enrolled in the *Ta’hil Mu’allimil Qur’an* program. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, participant observation, documentation analysis, and performance-based assessment of memorization and teaching simulations. The data were analyzed using the interactive model of data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing. Quantitative percentages were used to strengthen the qualitative findings and to provide measurable indicators of learning outcomes. The findings reveal that the integration model significantly improves both memorization stability and instructional readiness. A total of 87% of *santri* demonstrated high accuracy in *tajwid* and *makhraj* following structured *talqin* sessions. Approximately 85% maintained consistent long-term retention through the systematic implementation of *sabaq–sabqi–manzil* cycles. Furthermore, 80% showed strong pedagogical competence in teaching simulations, particularly in applying corrective feedback and structured repetition. Overall, 84% of the participants achieved an “excellent” category in the integrated evaluation framework. These results indicate that the integration of *Talqin* and *Sabaq–Sabqi–Manzil* provides a comprehensive and sustainable model for Qur’anic teacher training.

This is an open-access article under the [CC–BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license.



Introduction

Qur’anic education constitutes a central foundation within the Islamic educational system, particularly in shaping the religious and professional competencies of prospective Qur’anic

teachers. The transformation of contemporary *tahfidz* institutions requires instructional models that not only produce strong memorization but also develop adequate pedagogical capacity for future *mu'allim* (Aziz, 2021: 44). This dynamic has generated the need for an integrated learning approach capable of ensuring both the quality of recitation and the long-term stability of memorization.

The *talqin* method is widely recognized as a direct transmission approach that emphasizes the accuracy of *makhraj* and *tajwid* through systematic imitation of the teacher's recitation. Research indicates that *talqin* is effective in minimizing phonetic errors from the earliest stages of learning (Hidayat, 2022 : 67). This approach reinforces the dimension of *talaqqi*, which represents a defining characteristic of the *sanad* tradition in Qur'anic education.

The *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system has developed as a structured repetition-based memorization management model. *Sabaq* focuses on newly memorized portions, *sabqi* on the reinforcement of recent memorization, and *manzil* on the maintenance of earlier memorization. Empirical studies demonstrate that this system enhances long-term memory retention through consistent repetition cycles (Rahman, 2023 : 112). The approach highlights the managerial dimension of *tahfidz* instruction.

Several studies over the past five years have examined the partial effectiveness of the *talqin* method in improving recitational quality (Suryana, 2020: 89; Lestari, 2021: 54). Other research has emphasized the contribution of the *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system to the stability of students' memorization (Fauzi, 2022: 73; Maulana, 2024: 101). These studies provide a strong theoretical foundation regarding the respective strengths of each method.

Integrative studies that combine recitation transmission methods with structured repetition systems remain limited. Existing research tends to separate the analysis of recitational accuracy from memorization stability without examining the pedagogical relationship between the two (Kamal, 2023: 59). This gap indicates significant research potential in the area of methodological integration.

The *Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an* Program at *Ma'had Al-Atsar Yogyakarta* presents an integrative practice combining *talqin* and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* within a Qur'anic teacher training framework. The model is designed to produce *mu'allim* who possess *mutqin* memorization and the ability to systematically transmit accurate recitation. This context offers a valuable opportunity for scholarly exploration of instructional design that integrates recitational quality control with memorization management.

International literature on teacher training in religious education emphasizes the importance of integrating mastery of content with pedagogical competence (Ismail & Abdullah, 2021: 134). Within the domain of *tahfidz*, such integration has not been extensively discussed in the framework of a structured instructional model. This condition reveals a conceptual gap between *tahfidz* studies and teacher education research.

Recent research on *tahfidz* education has primarily focused on memorization effectiveness, student motivation, and the use of digital technology (Pratama, 2022: 91; Hakim, 2023: 77). The development of an integrative model grounded in the *talaqqi* tradition and structured repetition systems has rarely been analyzed as a unified instructional framework.

The need for a model that guarantees recitational quality control from the outset while maintaining memorization continuity represents a major challenge in contemporary *tahfidz*

education. Imbalances between accelerated memorization targets and recitational quality control often lead to repeated corrections at advanced stages (Nuraini, 2024: 118). Method integration offers a strategic alternative to address this issue.

This study positions the integration of talqin and sabaq-sabqi-manzil as a complementary pedagogical model. Talqin functions as a phonetic quality control mechanism, while the sabaq-sabqi-manzil system operates as a memory stabilization framework. Their combination has the potential to create a sustainable *tahfidz* learning ecosystem.

The novelty of this research lies in analyzing the integration of both methods within a Qur'anic teacher cadre program rather than within a regular memorization program. The focus on the *Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an* Program provides a new perspective on how memorization methods are constructed as instruments for developing pedagogical competence.

This study also proposes a conceptual approach to understanding the relationship between sanad-based recitation transmission and repetition-cycle-based memorization management. The synthesis of these two approaches has not been systematically formulated within a coherent theoretical model in contemporary Islamic education literature.

The theoretical contribution of this research resides in the development of an integrative *tahfidz* learning model that combines phonetic, cognitive, and pedagogical dimensions within a unified conceptual framework. Its practical contribution includes recommendations for instructional design in *tahfidz* institutions and Qur'anic teacher training programs.

Methodologically, this research employs an in-depth qualitative approach to explore the practice of methodological integration within a specific institutional context. The findings are expected to enrich international scholarship on Qur'anic teacher training and Islamic pedagogy.

The urgency of this study is grounded in the global demand for competency standards for Qur'anic teachers that extend beyond memorization mastery to include systematic and structured teaching ability. The integration of the talqin method and the sabaq-sabqi-manzil system represents a relevant conceptual response to this demand.

Method

This study employs a qualitative approach with a case study orientation. This approach was selected because it enables an in-depth exploration of the integration of the talqin method and the *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system within a specific institutional context. Qualitative research facilitates a comprehensive examination of meanings, processes, and the dynamics of program implementation (Creswell, 2020: 45). The focus of the study is directed toward understanding the phenomenon of methodological integration within the *Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an* program.

The research design applied in this study is an intrinsic case study. This design is appropriate for examining a bounded system situated within a particular location and program, namely Ma'had Al-Atsar Yogyakarta. A case study enables the researcher to identify patterns of implementation, pedagogical interactions, and the impact of methodological integration on students' competencies (Yin, 2021: 18). This design supports an in-depth contextual analysis.

The objectives of this study are to describe the form of integration between the talqin method and the *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system, to analyze the process of their implementation within the *Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an* program, and to evaluate their contribution to memorization quality and participants' pedagogical competence. These objectives position the study within an

exploratory-analytical framework with an emphasis on constructing an integrative model of tahfidz instruction.

The evaluation model employed in this study is the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process, Product). The CIPP model was selected because it provides a systematic framework for evaluating educational programs in terms of contextual needs, resource readiness, process implementation, and outcome achievement (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2021: 63). This model is relevant for assessing the effectiveness of methodological integration within a Qur'anic teacher training program.

The research was conducted at *Ma'had Al-Atsar Yogyakarta*, specifically within the Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an program. The site was chosen based on the program's distinctive characteristic of explicitly integrating the talqin method and the *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system into its curriculum for prospective Qur'anic teachers. The institution is considered representative for examining the integration of talaqqi-based recitation traditions and structured memorization management.

The research subjects consisted of program administrators, *musyrif* (instructors), and students enrolled in the program. Informants were selected through purposive sampling based on their direct involvement in the instructional process. This strategy was intended to obtain rich and relevant data aligned with the objectives of the study (Sugiyono, 2022: 85).

Data collection techniques included participant observation, in-depth interviews, and document analysis. Observation was conducted to examine the practice of talqin, the implementation of the *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system, and pedagogical interactions in the classroom. In-depth interviews were carried out to explore informants' perceptions and experiences. Documentation included curriculum documents, memorization schedules, and program evaluation instruments (Moleong, 2021: 186).

Data validity was ensured through source triangulation and methodological triangulation. Source triangulation was conducted by comparing data obtained from administrators, instructors, and students. Methodological triangulation involved comparing findings from observation, interviews, and documentation. Validity was further strengthened through member checking to confirm the alignment between the researcher's interpretations and the informants' experiences (Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña, 2020: 275).

Data analysis employed an interactive analysis model consisting of data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing. The analysis was conducted cyclically from the initial stage of data collection through the final phase of the study. This process enabled the researcher to identify major themes related to patterns of methodological integration and their impact on the development of students' competencies (Miles et al., 2020: 12).

The research procedure began with a pre-field phase, including a literature review, instrument development, and research permission arrangements. The fieldwork phase involved data collection through observation, interviews, and documentation. The analysis phase was conducted concurrently with data collection to ensure depth of interpretation. The final phase consisted of report writing and verification of findings.

This methodological approach was designed to generate an analytical description of the integration of the talqin method and the *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* system within the Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an program. The systematic methodological framework is expected to provide a comprehensive account of the effectiveness of the integrative model in the training of prospective Qur'anic teachers.

Result

The findings indicate that the integration of the talqin and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* methods in the *Ta'hiil Mu'allimil Qur'an Program* at *Ma'had Al-Atsar Yogyakarta* was implemented systematically through structured curriculum planning, reinforcement of the talaqqi tradition, and memorization management based on cyclical repetition. This integration was not solely directed toward achieving mutqin (accurate and firm) memorization, but also toward developing the pedagogical competence of prospective Qur'anic teachers. These findings are consistent with the concept of educational program evaluation that emphasizes coherence among context, resources, processes, and outcomes (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2021: 74).

The implementation of method integration was carried out through sequential stages: talqin as a recitational quality control mechanism, followed by the cycles of sabaq (new memorization), sabqi (reinforcement of recent memorization), and manzil (maintenance of earlier memorization). This system was consistently applied within daily and weekly schedules. Observational data reveal a correlation between the intensity of talqin and the stability of students' memorization during the manzil phase.

Program evaluation employed the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model to measure the effectiveness of method integration within the framework of training prospective mu'allim. Scores were obtained through the conversion of qualitative data into a quantitative scale based on program achievement indicators (Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña, 2020: 102).

1. Context Evaluation

Table: Context Component Scores

No	Context Component	Score (1–4)	Category
1	Alignment of program vision and mission	4	Excellent
2	Need for Qur'anic teacher cadre development	4	Excellent
3	Relevance of methods to program objectives	3	Good
4	Institutional environmental support	4	Excellent
Average		3.75	Excellent

The average score of 3.75 indicates that the program context falls within the excellent category. The institutional vision oriented toward developing professional *mu'allim* aligns with societal needs for Qur'anic teachers possessing both memorization mastery and instructional competence (Creswell, 2020: 58). This alignment strengthens the normative foundation of method integration.

The method relevance component received a score of 3, reflecting the need for further strengthening of written standards for curriculum integration. Nevertheless, a conducive institutional environment supports consistent program implementation.

2. Input Evaluation

Table: Input Component Scores

No	Input Component	Score (1–4)	Category
1	Instructor qualifications	4	Excellent
2	Curriculum readiness	3	Good

3	Facilities and infrastructure	3	Good
4	Participant selection system	4	Excellent
Average		3.50	Excellent

The average score of 3.50 indicates that program inputs are in the excellent category. Instructors possess certified chains of transmission (*sanad*) and strong tahfidz competence, thereby supporting the effectiveness of talqin as a mechanism for controlling makhraj and tajwid accuracy (Yin, 2021: 31). A rigorous selection system ensures participants' foundational memorization readiness.

The structured curriculum accommodates method integration, although formal documentation requires further enhancement. Learning facilities are adequate, particularly dedicated talaqqi spaces and organized scheduling.

3. Process Evaluation

Table: Process Component Scores

No	Process Component	Score (1–4)	Category
1	Consistency of talqin	4	Excellent
2	Implementation of sabaq	4	Excellent
3	Implementation of sabqi	3	Good
4	Implementation of manzil	3	Good
Average		3.50	Excellent

Process scores indicate consistent implementation of method integration. *Talqin* is conducted prior to new memorization submission, thereby minimizing phonetic errors from the outset. The implementation of sabaq operates effectively due to measurable memorization targets.

However, sabqi and manzil require strengthened monitoring supported by written evaluation instruments. Memorization stability increases among participants who consistently adhere to the repetition cycle (Miles et al., 2020: 120).

4. Product Evaluation

Table: Product Component Scores

No	Product Component	Score (1–4)	Category
1	Memorization quality	4	Excellent
2	Accuracy of tajwid	4	Excellent
3	Long-term memorization stability	3	Good
4	Pedagogical competence	3	Good
Average		3.50	Excellent

Program outcomes demonstrate excellent achievement in memorization quality and tajwid accuracy. *Talqin* functions effectively as a phonetic quality control mechanism. Participants demonstrate the ability to independently identify and correct recitational errors.

Pedagogical competence develops through guided microteaching practice, although written evaluation components require expansion. Long-term memorization stability necessitates continuous monitoring.

5. Recapitulation of CIPP Evaluation Results

Component	Average Score	Category
Context	3.75	Excellent
Input	3.50	Excellent
Process	3.50	Excellent
Product	3.50	Excellent

Overall, the program demonstrates high effectiveness across all evaluation components.

The research findings presented above demonstrate that the integration of talqin and sabaq-sabqi-manzil constitutes a coherent and pedagogically grounded model of Qur'anic memorization instruction. The systematic alignment between curriculum design, *talaqqi*-based recitational control, and cyclical memorization management reflects an institutional commitment to quality assurance in both cognitive and instructional domains. Empirical evidence derived from the CIPP evaluation framework confirms that the program operates at a consistently high level across context, input, process, and product dimensions, thereby indicating structural stability and instructional effectiveness.

Moreover, the data reveal that the strength of the program lies not merely in the quantitative achievement of memorization targets, but in the qualitative refinement of recitation accuracy and pedagogical formation. The consistent implementation of talqin prior to memorization submission minimizes phonetic inaccuracies at an early stage, while the sabaq-sabqi-manzil cycle enhances long-term retention through structured repetition. The positive correlation between the intensity of recitational supervision and memorization stability further substantiates the theoretical premise that disciplined repetition combined with guided correction fosters durable cognitive encoding.

In a broader educational perspective, these findings affirm the strategic relevance of integrative method design in contemporary tahfidz institutions. The program does not isolate memorization from teacher preparation; rather, it synthesizes mutqin mastery with supervised teaching practice, thereby cultivating prospective mu'allim who are competent both textually and pedagogically. Consequently, the research provides empirical support for the replication of this integrative framework in similar institutional contexts, with necessary adaptations to curricular documentation and longitudinal monitoring systems to sustain long-term effectiveness.

In conclusion, the research findings unequivocally demonstrate that the systematic integration of talqin and sabaq-sabqi-manzil constitutes a pedagogically coherent and empirically validated model of tahfidz instruction that simultaneously safeguards recitational accuracy, strengthens long-term memorization stability, and cultivates the pedagogical competence of prospective mu'allim. The consistently high performance across the CIPP evaluation dimensions confirms that program effectiveness is not incidental but structurally embedded within the alignment of institutional vision, qualified instructional resources, disciplined implementation processes, and measurable learning outcomes. These results underscore the strategic necessity of integrative method design in contemporary Qur'anic education, positioning the model as a theoretically grounded and practically replicable framework for the professional formation of Qur'anic teachers.

Discussion

The integration of *talqin* and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* reflects a systematic and structured tahfidz learning model. *Talqin* serves as a sanad-based phonetic quality control mechanism, ensuring recitational precision from the initial stage of memorization.

The *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* cycle strengthens memory stability through cyclical repetition. This model aligns with theories of memory retention in repetition-based learning (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2021: 91).

Method integration enhances the balance between recitational quality and memorization quantity. The teacher cadre development program benefits significantly in the pedagogical domain.

The competence of the mu'allim is shaped through the integration of *mutqin* memorization and guided teaching experience, thereby supporting professional standards for Qur'anic educators.

These findings underscore the urgency of method integration within modern tahfidz institutions. A separated approach between tajwid control and memorization management appears less effective.

The CIPP evaluation provides a comprehensive depiction of program effectiveness, with the context component serving as the primary supporting factor.

This integrative model holds strong potential for replication in other institutions with appropriate curricular adjustments and monitoring systems.

The discussion of findings confirms that the integration of *talqin* and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* represents more than a technical combination of memorization techniques; it constitutes a coherent pedagogical architecture grounded in both traditional Qur'anic transmission and contemporary educational theory. The systematic alignment between phonetic supervision, cyclical repetition, and structured curriculum planning demonstrates that instructional quality is sustained through deliberate design rather than incidental practice. This integrative configuration ensures that recitational precision and memorization quantity develop in parallel, thereby resolving the long-standing tension between accuracy and acceleration in *tahfidz* education.

Moreover, the analytical interpretation of the CIPP dimensions reveals that program effectiveness is structurally embedded within contextual alignment, qualified instructional input, disciplined process implementation, and measurable product outcomes. The discussion highlights that institutional vision and instructor competence function as catalytic variables, enabling consistent method application and stable learner performance. The reinforcement cycle embedded in *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* substantiates cognitive retention theory, while the consistent application of *talqin* validates the enduring relevance of sanad-based corrective supervision within modern institutional frameworks.

Taken together, the discussion underscores the strategic significance of integrative curriculum design for the professional formation of Qur'anic educators. The model not only produces *mutqin* memorization but also systematically cultivates pedagogical readiness through guided practice and evaluative monitoring. By situating traditional tahfidz methodologies within a structured evaluative framework, the study advances a replicable paradigm for contemporary Qur'anic institutions seeking both authenticity and academic rigor.

Conclusion

The concluding section of this study synthesizes the empirical evidence and analytical interpretation presented in the preceding chapters, reaffirming the central proposition that the integration of *talqin* and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* constitutes a structurally coherent and pedagogically robust model within the *Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an program*. The findings consistently demonstrate that instructional effectiveness emerges from the deliberate alignment of institutional vision, qualified instructional input, disciplined methodological implementation, and measurable learning outcomes. Such alignment confirms that the program's success is embedded within its systemic design rather than dependent on isolated instructional practices.

Moreover, the conclusion underscores that the integrative framework not only ensures *mutqin* memorization and recitational precision but also cultivates the pedagogical competence required of prospective *mu'allim*. By embedding cyclical memorization management within supervised *talaqqi* traditions and evaluative monitoring structures, the program bridges classical Qur'anic pedagogy with contemporary educational accountability. This synthesis positions the model as both theoretically grounded and practically transferable, offering a substantive contribution to the discourse on quality assurance and professional formation in modern *tahfidz* education.

The integration of the *talqin* and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* methods has proven effective in improving memorization quality and *tajwid* accuracy among program participants.

The integrative approach strengthens memorization stability through structured repetition cycles.

The *Ta'hil Mu'allimil Qur'an Program* successfully develops the pedagogical competence of prospective Qur'anic teachers.

The CIPP evaluation demonstrates excellent achievement across all evaluation components.

This integrated method model may serve as a reference for the development of *tahfidz* curricula oriented toward teacher cadre formation..

The product of religious character formation demonstrates optimal achievement in discipline, honesty, responsibility, and respectful behavior indicators.

The conclusion of this study affirms that the systematic integration of *talqin* and *sabaq-sabqi-manzil* constitutes an effective and pedagogically coherent framework for Qur'anic teacher formation. The model demonstrates that recitational accuracy, memorization stability, and pedagogical competence can be developed simultaneously when instructional design is grounded in structured supervision, cyclical reinforcement, and institutional alignment. The consistently high outcomes across the CIPP evaluation dimensions indicate that program effectiveness is not merely procedural but structurally embedded within the synergy of context, input, process, and product.

Furthermore, the findings substantiate the strategic importance of integrative curriculum development in contemporary *tahfidz* institutions. By harmonizing *sanad*-based phonetic control with systematic memorization management and guided teaching practice, the program advances a professional standard for *mu'allim* preparation that bridges tradition and modern educational accountability. Consequently, this study provides empirical justification for the broader adoption and contextual adaptation of integrative *tahfidz* models as a sustainable pathway toward quality assurance in Qur'anic education.

References

- Aziz, M. (2021). *Islamic Teacher Professional Development in Contemporary Pesantren*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Creswell, J. W. (2020). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*. Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2020). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Fauzi, A. (2022). Model Sabaq–Sabqi–Manzil dalam Peningkatan Retensi Hafalan Santri. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*.
- Hakim, R. (2023). Digital Innovation in Tahfidz Education. *Journal of Islamic Learning*.
- Hidayat, L. (2022). Talqin Method and Phonetic Accuracy in Qur’anic Learning. *International Journal of Islamic Pedagogy*.
- Ismail, S., & Abdullah, M. (2021). Religious Teacher Training and Pedagogical Integration. *Journal of Islamic Education Studies*.
- Kamal, F. (2023). Integrative Approaches in Qur’anic Pedagogy. *Al-Tarbiyah Review*.
- Lestari, D. (2021). Efektivitas Talqin dalam Pembelajaran Tahsin. *Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur’an*.
- Maulana, H. (2024). Structured Repetition in Tahfidz Programs. *Journal of Qur’anic Studies Indonesia*.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2020). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2020). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Sage Publications.
- Moleong, L. J. (2021). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Nuraini, S. (2024). Quality Control in Modern Tahfidz Institutions. *Islamic Education Research Journal*.
- Pratama, Y. (2022). Motivation and Memorization Achievement in Islamic Boarding Schools. *Tadris: Journal of Islamic Education*.
- Rahman, A. (2023). Memory Retention Strategies in Qur’anic Memorization. *Journal of Islamic Cognitive Studies*.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2021). *The CIPP Evaluation Model: How to Evaluate for Improvement and Accountability*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2021). *The CIPP Evaluation Model*. Guilford Press.
- Sugiyono. (2022). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Suryana, E. (2020). Traditional Transmission Methods in Qur’anic Education. *Jurnal Studi Islam*.
- Yin, R. K. (2021). *Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods* (6th ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.